



Debate Winter School

WORKBOOK

Worksheets & Exercises



WORKSHEET 1 - DRILL

Asking/Answering Theses

Instructions: Decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. The Challenger says “Take the subject” and says the written subject. Then they say “It follows that it is” and then says the predicate. You may add articles like “the, a, an” as desired, or add “s” for a plural.

The Defender then answers with either “I accept” or “Why?” After #15, switch roles. Ask and answer as quickly as you can!

1	Subject: Cow	It follows it is: Animal
2	Subject: Cow	It follows it is: Camel
3	Subject: Camel	It follows it is: Mammal
4	Subject: Mammal	It follows it is: Camel
5	Subject: Car	It follows it is: Train
6	Subject: Train car	It follows it is: Car
7	Subject: Toyota	It follows it is: Car
8	Subject: Car	It follows it is: Toyota Prius
9	Subject: Tesla	It follows it is: Car
10	Subject: Boat	It follows it is: Form
11	Subject: Boat	It follows it is: Color
12	Subject: Boat	It follows it is: Shape
13	Subject: Shape of a boat	It follows it is: Boat
14	Subject: Shape of a boat	It follows it is: Long shape
15	Subject: Shape of a boat	It follows it is: Tall shape
16	Subject: Shape of a boat	It follows it is: Form
17	Subject: Form	It follows it is: Shape
18	Subject: Form	It follows it is: Color
19	Subject: Red	It follows it is: Color

20	Subject: Green	It follows it is: Color
21	Subject: Green	It follows it is: Primary color
22	Subject: Color of grass	It follows it is: Primary color
23	Subject: Color of grass	It follows it is: Green
24	Subject: Color of clouds	It follows it is: Secondary color
25	Subject: Color of clouds	It follows it is: White
26	Subject: Color of clouds	It follows it is: Primary color
27	Subject: Primary color	It follows it is: White
28	Subject: Color of a car	It follows it is: Blue
29	Subject: Color of a car	It follows it is: Color
30	Subject: Color of light	It follows it is: White

WORKSHEET 2 - DRILL

Asking/Answering Theses 2

Instructions: Decide who will be challenger and who will be defender. The challenger says “Take the subject” and says the written subject. Then they say “It follows it is” and then says the predicate. You may add articles or plural markers as desired. The defender then answers with either “I accept” or “Why?”

Ask and answer as quickly as you can! Switch roles after #15.

1	Subject: The Empire State Building	It follows it is: Shape
2	Subject: The Empire State Building	It follows it is: High shape
3	Subject: The Empire State Building	It follows it is: Even shape
4	Subject: Soundwaves	It follows it is: Sound
5	Subject: The sound of bells	It follows it is: Sound
6	Subject: The sound of bells	It follows it is: Intelligible sound
7	Subject: A cat’s purr	It follows it is: Unintelligible sound
8	Subject: The word “Hello”	It follows it is: Sound
9	Subject: The word “Hello”	It follows it is: Unintelligible sound
10	Subject: The word “Hello”	It follows it: Creates an understanding of semantic content

11	Subject: The gesture of a hand wave	It follows it: Creates an understanding of semantic content
12	Subject: The gesture of a hand wave	It follows it is: Intelligible sound
13	Subject: The gesture of a hand wave	It follows it is: Shape
14	Subject: An explosion	It follows it is: Sound
15	Subject: The Big Bang	It follows it is: Sound
16	Subject: Beethoven's 5th	It follows it is: Intelligible sound
17	Subject: The smell of incense	It follows it is: Smell
18	Subject: The smell of incense	It follows it is: Natural smell
19	Subject: The smell of incense	It follows it is: Fragrant smell
20	Subject: The smell of soap	It follows it is: Artificial smell
21	Subject: The smell of garbage	It follows it is: Natural smell
22	Subject: The smell of fresh cut grass	It follows it is: Woody smell
23	Subject: The flavor of masala	It follows it is: Taste
24	Subject: The flavor of masala	It follows it is: Spicy taste
25	Subject: The flavor of ginger	It follows it is: Sweet taste
26	Subject: The flavor of onions	It follows it is: Astringent taste
27	Subject: Feather	It follows it is: Tactile object
28	Subject: Feather	It follows it is: Lightness tactile object
29	Subject: Feather	It follows it is: Softness tactile object
30	Subject: The Empire State Building	It follows it is: The solid element earth

WORKSHEET 3 - DRILL

Asking/Answering Theses 3

Instructions: Decide who will be challenger and who will be defender. The challenger says “Take the subject” and says the written subject. Then they say “It follows it is” and then says the predicate. You may add articles or plural markers as desired. The defender then answers with either “I accept” or “Why?”

Ask and answer as quickly as you can! Switch roles after #15.

1	Subject: The color blue	It follows it is: The color of a blue car
2	Subject: The color of a blue car	It follows it is: The color blue
3	Subject: The color of a blue sky	It follows it is: Blue
4	Subject: The color of a blue sky	It follows it is: The color of light
5	Subject: The color of a blue sky	It follows it is: Secondary color
6	Subject: The color of a blue sky	It follows it is: The color of a blue car
7	Subject: The color of light	It follows it is: Existent
8	Subject: The color of a cloud	It follows it is: Thing
9	Subject: The word “Goodbye”	It follows it is: Impermanent object
10	Subject: The word “Goodbye”	It follows it is: Matter
11	Subject: The word “Goodbye”	It follows it is: Particle-like or composed of particles
12	Subject: Thing	It follows it is: An object of thought

13	Subject: Rabbit's horn	It follows it is: An object of conceptual thought
14	Subject: Unicorn	It follows it is: Object
15	Subject: Rabbit's horn	It follows it is: Knowable object
16	Subject: Thing	It follows it is: One
17	Subject: Object	It follows it is: Different
18	Subject: Things and objects	It follows they are: One
19	Subject: Things are objects	It follows they are: Causes
20	Subject: Established base	It follows it is: Cause
21	Subject: Existent	It follows it is: Permanent object
22	Subject: Object	It follows it is: Impermanent object
23	Subject: Mind	It follows it is: Permanent object
24	Subject: Consciousness	It follows it is: Mind
25	Subject: Non-thing	It follows it is: Existent
26	Subject: Non-mind	It follows it is: Negative object
27	Subject: Non-mind	It follows it is: Positive object
28	Subject: Impermanent object	It follows it is: Positive object
29	Subject: Permanent object	It follows it is: Negative object
30	Subject: The water element	It follows it is: Liquid

SCRIPT

Counting Debate

A Counting Debate is simply where the debaters go through an outline to lay the groundwork for a logic debate – it is like a quiz testing if the Defender has memorized the outline.

Instructions: Decide who will be Defender and who will be Challenger. The challenger reads the lines beginning with “C” and the Defender reads the lines beginning with “D.” Then switch roles and repeat.

Red text = Subject

Blue text = Predicate

C: *DHI Jitar Chochen!*

It follows that you can posit the definition of matter.

D: I accept.

C: Posit it!

D: Take the subject: something that is established as particle-like or composed of particles.

C: Take the subject: something that is established as particle-like or composed of particles. It follows that it is the definition of matter?

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of matter!

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject: External matter and internal matter.

C: Take the subject: External matter and internal matter. It follows these are the divisions of matter?

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the definition of external matter?

D: I accept.

C: Posit it.

D: Take the subject: a physical cause giving rise to sense impressions which is not found within the continuum of a conscious organism.

C: Take the subject a physical cause giving rise to sense impressions which is not found within the continuum of a conscious organism. It follows that it's the definition of external matter.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of external matter?

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject:

forms
sounds
smells
tastes
tactile objects

C: Take the subject:

forms
sounds
smells
tastes
tactile objects

It follows these are the divisions of external matter.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the definition of form.

D: I accept.

C: Posit it!

D: Take the subject: an object given over to experience through the eye sensing modality and seen in the domain of visual consciousness.

C: Take the subject: an object given over to experience through the eye sensing modality and seen in the domain of visual consciousness. It follows that it's the definition of form.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of form?

D: I accept.

C: Posit them

D: Take the subject: shapes and colors.

C: Take the subject: shapes and colors. It follows they are the divisions of form.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the definition of shape.

D: I accept.

C: Posit it.

D: Take the subject: something reasonably identified as shape.

C: Take the subject: something reasonably identified as shape. It follows that it is the definition of shape.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of shape?

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject:

Long shape
Short shape
High shape
Low shape
Round shape
Cubed shape
Even shape
Uneven shape

C: Take the subject:

Long shape
Short shape
High shape
Low shape
Round shape
Cubed shape
Even shape
Uneven shape

It follows these are the divisions of shape.

D: I accept.

C: It follows that you can posit the definition of long shape.

D: I accept.

C: What is it?

D: Take the subject: A shape characterized by lengthiness.

C: Take the subject: **A shape characterized by lengthiness**. It follows that it's **the definition of long shape**.

D: I accept.

Follow the same pattern for definitions of short shape, high shape, etc.

C: It follows that you can posit the definition of color.

D: I accept.

C: Posit it.

D: Take the subject: **Something reasonably described as hue**.

C: Take the subject: **Something reasonably described as hue**. It follows that it's **the definition of color**.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of colors?

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject: **primary colors and secondary colors**.

C: Take the subject: **primary colors and secondary colors**. It follows they are **the divisions of colors**.

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the definition of primary color?

D: I accept

C: Posit it.

D: Take the subject: **Something reasonably described as a primary hue**.

C: Take the subject: **Something reasonably described as a primary hue.** It follows that it's **the definition of primary color.**

D: I accept.

Follow the same pattern for definition of secondary colors

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of primary colors in additive color mixing (mixing light).

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject:

Red

Green

Blue

C: Take the subject:

Red

Green

Blue

It follows these are **the divisions of primary color in additive color mixing.**

D: I accept.

Definitions of each color follow the same pattern as for primary color, i.e., something reasonably described as a red hue, etc.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of primary colors in subtractive color mixing (mixing pigments).

D: I accept.

C: Posit them.

D: Take the subject:

Blue

Yellow

Red

White

C: Take the subject:

Blue
Yellow
Red
white

It follows these are **the divisions of primary color in subtractive color mixing.**

D: I accept.

Definitions of each color follow the same pattern as for primary color, i.e., something reasonably described as a blue hue, etc.

C: It follows you can posit the divisions of secondary colors.

D: I accept.

C: Posit them

D: Take the subject:

The color of clouds
The color of smoke
The color of dust
The color of mist
The color of light
The color of darkness
The color of sunrays
The color of shadows

C: Take the subject:

The color of clouds
The color of smoke
The color of dust
The color of mist
The color of light
The color of darkness
The color of sunrays
The color of shadows

It follows those are **the divisions of secondary colors.**

D: I accept.

C: It follows you can posit the definition of the color of clouds.

D: I accept.

C: Posit it.

D: Take the subject: **something reasonably described as the hue of clouds.**

C: Take the subject: **something reasonably described as the hue of clouds.** It follows that it is **the definition of the color of clouds.**

D: I accept.

*Definitions and divisions of the remaining types of exterior matter follow the same pattern as for forms. Find the definitions and divisions in the textbook **Nalanda Debate: Logic for Your World.***

WORKSHEET 4 - DRILL

Choosing your Responses

Instructions: Decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. The Challenger will start by reading the first two columns (labeled C) and then the Defender (D) will respond. Both Challenger and Defender continue responding as indicated, choosing from the options given.

1.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is something reasonably identified as shape [definition]
The Empire State Building	shape	Why?	because it is something reasonably identified as shape [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

2.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a shape characterized by tallness [definition]
The Empire State Building	high shape	Why?	because it is a shape characterized by tallness [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

3.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject... The Empire State Building	It follows that it is... even shape	I accept	because...?	because it is a shape characterized by evenness or flatness [definition]
		Why?	because it is a shape characterized by evenness or flatness [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

4.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject... Soundwaves	It follows that it is... sound	I accept	because...?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness. [definition]
		Why?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness. [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

5.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject... The sound of bells	It follows that it is... sound	I accept	Because...?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness. [definition]
		Why?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness. [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

6.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject... The sound of bells	It follows that it is... intelligible sound	I accept	because...?	because it is an object in the domain of auditory consciousness which creates an understanding of semantic content. [definition]
		Why?	because it is an object in the domain of auditory consciousness which creates an understanding of semantic content. [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

So far, we have given only definitions as reasons, but you can provide other reasons also. for example....

7.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is intelligible sound [category/division]
the word "hello"	sound	Why?	because it is intelligible sound. [category/division]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

8.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is speech [equivalent phenomenon]
the word "hello"	intelligible sound	Why?	because it is speech [equivalent phenomenon]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

9.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is intelligible sound [definiendum]
the word "hello"	an object in the domain of auditory consciousness which creates an understanding of semantic content.	Why?	because it is intelligible sound [definiendum]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

Till now, *most* of us will agree on the above theses (if you don't that's great too!).

But now let's see about some more controversial theses.

For now, if you are confused by the difference between "reason not true" and "no pervasion"... don't panic. We will cover this again.

Some of these are very tricky. For now, take note of any confusion you have and we will discuss them when we reassemble.

10.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject... a cat's purr	It follows that it is... unintelligible sound	I accept	because...?	because it is an object in the domain of auditory consciousness which does not express a meaning. [definition]
		Why?	because it is an object in the domain of auditory consciousness which does not express a meaning. [definition]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

11.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	Because it creates an understanding of semantic content.
the gesture of a hand wave	intelligible sound	Why?	because it creates an understanding of semantic content.	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

12.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it...	I accept	because...?	because it is communication
the gesture of a hand wave	creates an understanding of semantic content.	Why?	because it is communication	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

13.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is intelligible sound
the gesture of a hand wave	sound	Why?	because it is intelligible sound	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

14.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness.
an explosion	sound	Why?	because it is an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness.	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

15.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.
an explosion	form	Why?	because it is an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

16.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is not matter
an explosion	not sound	Why?	because it is not matter	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

17.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is an explosion
the big bang	sound	Why?	because it is an explosion	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

You're doing great!

18.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is sound which expresses meaning
Beethoven's 5 th Symphony	intelligible sound	Why?	because it is sound which expresses meaning	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

19.

C	C:	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a fragrant smell
smell of incense	smell	Why?	Because it is a fragrant smell	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

20.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a smell that does not arise from mixing ingredients
smell of incense	natural smell	Why?	because it is a smell that does not arise from mixing ingredients	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

21.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a smell that arises from mixing ingredients
smell of incense	Artificial smell	Why?	because it is a smell that arises from mixing ingredients	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

22.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a fruity smell
smell of soap	artificial smell	Why?	because it is a fruity smell	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

23.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is not an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.
the flavour of onions	not a form	Why?	because it is not an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

24.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is a taste
onions	not a form	Why?	because it is a taste	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

25.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because it is not a fruity smell .
the flavour of onions	not a smell	Why?	because it is not a fruity smell .	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

WORKSHEET 5 - DRILL

Reason True or Reason Not True

Instructions: The following syllogisms have reasons that are either true or not true. The Challenger will read out the subject, predicate and reason and the Defender will respond with “Reason not true” or “Reason true.” Then change roles. You can start slowly but try to get faster as you practice.

Please remember that the phrase “Reason true” is not said ordinarily during debate – we are using it to simplify the syllogism; to just consider the reason e.g.

Take the subject:	It follow it is:	because it is:	Answer?
A flower	internal matter	external matter	REASON TRUE

To determine how to answer as the Defender,

Ask yourself: is a flower, external matter?

(if **no** then “reason not true”)

(if **yes** then “reason true”)

* Remember the reason might be true even though the syllogism is flawed. Just focus on the relation between the subject and the reason.

Now respond to the following with reason true/reason not true.

1	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: matter
2	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: an elephant
3	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: external matter	because it is: matter
4	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: the ear’s modality.
5	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: color	because it is: primary color
6	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: high shape	because it is: shape
7	Subject: the color blue	It follows it is: secondary color	because it is: a color

SERA JEY DWS 2023

8	Subject: the color of clouds	It follows it is: matter	because it is: form
9	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: secondary color	because it is: shape
10	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably identified as shape.
11.	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue.
12	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a color	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue.
13.	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a color
14.	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a taste
15	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: exterior matter
16	Subject: a form	It follows it is: a color	because it is: an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.
17	Subject: a form	It follows it is: a color	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue.
18	Subject: something reasonably described as a secondary hue	It follows it is: not a color	because it is: a secondary color
19	Subject: something reasonably described as a hue	It follows it is: the color of mist	because it is: a color
20	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: tangible object	because it is: matter
21	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: something that is established as particle-like or composed of particles

SERA JEY DWS 2023

22	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: a secondary color.
23	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: not blue
24	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: blue
25	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: a shape
26	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: not intelligible sound.
27	Subject: a lemon	It follows it is: a woody smell	because it is: not a chemical smell
28	Subject: the smell of a lemon	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a chemical smell
29	Subject: a fragrant smell	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a shape
30	Subject: softness	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a smell

WORKSHEET 6 - DRILL

Pervasion or No Pervasion

Instructions: The following syllogisms have either pervasion or no pervasion. The Challenger will read out the subject, predicate and reason and the Defender will respond with “Pervasion” or “No pervasion.” Then change roles. You can start slowly but try to get faster as you practice.

Please recall that we do not use the phrase “Pervasion” as an answer when actually debating – it is used in this exercise for the sake of training.

e.g.

Take the subject:	It follow it is:	because it has:	Answer?
A flower	Sound	External matter	NO PERVASION

As the Defender, ask yourself the following question to determine which answer to give -

Ask yourself: is everything which is external matter a sound?

(if **no** then “no pervasion”)

(if **yes** then “pervasion”)

* Remember that there might be pervasion even though the syllogism is flawed. Just focus on the relation between the reason and the predicate.

Now respond to the following with pervasion/no pervasion.

1	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: matter
2	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: external matter	because it is: an elephant
3	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: external matter	because it is: matter
4	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: the ear's modality
5	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: color	because it is: primary color
6	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: high shape	because it is: shape
7	Subject: the color blue	It follows it is: colour	because it is: a secondary color
8	Subject: the color of clouds	It follows it is: matter	because it is: form
9	Subject: the colour red	It follows it is: secondary color	because it is: shape
10	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably identified as shape
11	Subject: the colour red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue

12	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a color	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue
13	Subject: shape	It follows it is: Matter	because it is: something that is established as particle-like or compose of particles
14	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a color
15	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a taste
16	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: exterior matter
17	Subject: matter	It follows it is: form	because it is: an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness
18	Subject: something reasonably described as a secondary hue	It follows it is: not a color	because it is: a secondary color

19	Subject: something reasonably described as a hue	It follows it is: secondary color	because it is: The color of mist
20	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: tangible object	because it is: matter
21	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: something that is established as particle-like or composed of particles
22	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: not a tangible object
23	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: not blue
24	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: the color of a blue sky	because it is: blue
25	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: a shape
26	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: not intelligible sound
27	Subject: a lemon	It follows it is: a not a woody smell	because it is: a chemical smell

28	Subject: the smell of a lemon	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a chemical smell
29	Subject: a fragrent smell	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a shape
30	Subject: softness	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a smell

WORKSHEET 7 DRILL

Giving Your Own Reasons & Predicates

Instructions: Decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. The Challenger will start with the first two columns (labeled C), and the Defender (D) will respond. Then continue as before. But this time the Challenger or Defender must provide their **own reasons**.

Now let's try with you **providing your own reasons**.

First experiment with using a definition of the predicate as a reason.

1.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because [put your own reason in here.]
smell of garbage	smell	Why?	because ...[put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

2.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because [put your own reason in here.]
the flavour of masala	smell	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

3.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because [put your own reason in here.]
the flavour of masala	taste	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

4.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
a feather	tactile object	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

5.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
a feather	matter	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

Now try to use a **category/division** of the predicate as a reason.

6.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
red	colour	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

SERA JEY DWS 2023

7.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
red	shape	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

8.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
sweet taste	external matter	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

9.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
sweet taste	internal matter	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

10.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
apple	form	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

11.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
lemon	taste	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

Great! Lets make this a bit harder now. Providing your own **predicates** as well as **reasons**.

12.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
form	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

13.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
white	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

14.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
white rose	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

15.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
the smell of musty clothes	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

16.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
an iPhone	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

17.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is...	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
an electron	[put your own predicate here]	Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

18.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is... [put your own predicate here]	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
Planet Earth		Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

19.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is... [put your own predicate here]	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
an impermanent object		Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

20.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is... [put your own predicate here]	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
existent		Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

21.

C	C	D	C	D
Take the subject...	It follows that it is... [put your own predicate here]	I accept	because...?	because... [put your own reason in here.]
the body's modality		Why?	because [put your own reason in here]	reason not true
				no pervasion
				I accept

WORKSHEET 8 - DRILL

Thesis vs. Pervasion

Instructions: Decide who will be the Challenger and who will be Defender. The Challenger reads the thesis saying “Take the subject,” then reads the written subject and predicate. Add articles like “the, a, an” as desired. The Defender then answers with either “I accept” or “Why?” The Challenger then reads the statement of pervasion, exactly as written. The Defender again answers with either “I accept” or “Why?” Switch roles after 15 questions.

Pay close attention and take note if it seems like the thesis statements and pervasions should get different responses or the same responses.

1	Subject: The color red	It follows it is: Primary color
2	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the colour red	Then it’s necessarily primary color
3	Subject: The colour of a cloud	It follows it is: secondary color
4	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the color of a cloud	Then it’s necessarily secondary color
5	Subject: The taste of chocolate	It follows it is: sweet taste
6	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the taste of chocolate	Then it’s necessarily sweet taste
7	Subject: The shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: high shape
8	It follows that if <i>it</i> is The shape of an oak tree	Then it’s necessarily high shape
9	Subject: Color	It follows it is: Form
10	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Color	Then it’s necessarily Form
11	Subject: Color	It follows it is: a category under which Red falls
12	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Color	Then it’s necessarily a category under which Red falls
13	Subject: Something reasonably described as hue	It follows it is: The definition of color

14	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Something reasonably described as hue	Then it's necessarily The definition of color
15	Subject: Color	It follows it is: A singular object
	Now Switch Roles	
16	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Color	Then it's necessarily A singular object
17	Subject: Referent of the word "white"	It follows it is: the color white
18	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Referent of the word "white"	Then it's necessarily the color white
19	Subject: Eye	It follows it is: Internal matter
20	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Eye	Then it's necessarily Internal matter
21	Subject: The color of light	It follows it is: Secondary color
22	It follows that if <i>it</i> is The color of light	Then it's necessarily Secondary color
23	Subject: a ball	It follows it is: Round shape
24	It follows that if <i>it</i> is a ball	Then it's necessarily Round shape
25	Subject: A baby's cry	It follows it is: Intelligible sound
26	It follows that if <i>it</i> is a baby's cry	Then it's necessarily Intelligible sound
27	Subject: The smell of shampoo	It follows it is: Artificial smell
28	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the smell of shampoo	Then it's necessarily artificial smell
29	Subject: The taste of lemons	It follows it is: Sour taste
30	It follows that if <i>it</i> is The taste of lemons	Then it's necessarily Sour taste

WORKSHEET 9 - DRILL

Thesis vs. Pervasion

Instructions: Decide who will be the Challenger and who will be Defender. The Challenger reads the thesis saying “Take the subject,” then reads the written subject and predicate. Add articles like “the, a, an” as desired. The Defender then answers with either “I accept” or “Why?” The Challenger then reads the statement of pervasion, exactly as written. The Defender again answers with either “I accept” or “Why?” Switch roles after 15 questions.

Pay close attention and take note if it seems like the thesis statements and pervasions should get different responses or the same responses.

1	Subject: Fire	It follows it is: Cause of smoke
2	It follows that if <i>it</i> is fire	Then it’s necessarily cause of smoke
3	Subject: The cause of an oak tree	It follows it is: oak seed
4	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the cause of an oak tree	Then it’s necessarily oak seed
5	Subject: The taste of chocolate	It follows it is: one nature with chocolate
6	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the taste of chocolate	Then it’s necessarily one nature with chocolate
7	Subject: Shape	It follows it is: quality of an oak tree
8	It follows that if <i>it</i> is shape	Then it’s necessarily quality of an oak tree
9	Subject: Color	It follows it is: not a plural object
10	It follows that if <i>it</i> is color	Then it’s necessarily not a plural object
11	Subject: Blue	It follows it is: color of a blue car
12	It follows that if <i>it</i> is blue	Then it’s necessarily color of a blue car
13	Subject: The color of a car	It follows it is: secondary color
14	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the color of a car	Then it’s necessarily secondary color

15	Subject: Existent	It follows it is: permanent object
	Now Switch Roles	
16	It follows that if <i>it</i> is existent	Then it's necessarily permanent object
17	Subject: Mind	It follows it is: conscious
18	It follows that if <i>it</i> is mind	Then it's necessarily conscious
19	Subject: The smell of flowers	It follows it is: pleasant smell
20	It follows that if <i>it</i> is the smell of flowers	Then it's necessarily pleasant smell
21	Subject: Cause of an oak tree	It follows it is: direct cause of an oak tree
22	It follows that if <i>it</i> is cause of an oak tree	Then it's necessarily direct cause of an oak tree
23	Subject: Square	It follows it is: shape
24	It follows that if <i>it</i> is square	Then it's necessarily shape
25	Subject: Bodhisattva	It follows it is: Human
26	It follows that if <i>it</i> is bodhisattva	Then it's necessarily human
27	Subject: Buddha	It follows it is: Person
28	It follows that if <i>it</i> is Buddha	Then it's necessarily person
29	Subject: Thing	It follows it is: Conceptual isolate of thing
30	It follows that if <i>it</i> is thing	Then it's necessarily conceptual isolate of thing

WORKSHEET 10 - DRILL

2 Theses for 1 Pervasion

Instructions: First decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender.

Challenger will read out the statement of pervasion and Defender will say “I accept.” Then the Challenger states the two thesis statements that are implied by the pervasion. Challenger must think of their own subject to use. The Defender says “I accept” after each one. After exercise #15, switch roles.

e.g.

C: It follows that if **it** is **matter**, it is necessarily **impermanent**.

D: I accept.

C: Take the subject: **the sound of thunder**. It follows that it's **matter**.

D: I accept.

C: Take the subject: **the sound of thunder**. It follows that it's **impermanent**.

D: I accept.

1 It follows that if **it** is **external matter**, then it's necessarily **matter**.

2 It follows that if **it** is **form**, then it's necessarily **external matter**.

3 It follows that if **it** is **shape**, then it's necessarily **external matter**.

4 It follows that if **it** is **a round shape**, then it's necessarily **a shape**.

5 It follows that if **it** is a shape of orb-like quality, then it's necessarily a round shape.

6 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily a color.

7 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily form.

8 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily external matter.

9 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily matter.

10 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily particle-like or composed of particles.

11 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily impermanent.

12 It follows that if **it** is the color of darkness, then it's necessarily selfless.

13 It follows that if **it** is impermanent, then it's necessarily selfless.

14 It follows that if **it** is color, then it's necessarily something reasonably described as a hue.

15 It follows that if **it** is **shape**, then it's necessarily **something reasonably identified as shape**.

Now Switch Roles

16 It follows that if **it** is **intelligible sound**, then it's necessarily **sound**.

17 It follows that if **it** is **intelligible sound**, then it's necessarily **verbal speech**.

18 It follows that if **it** is **sound**, then it's necessarily **external matter**.

19 It follows that if **it** is **external matter**, then it's necessarily **something that is particle-like or composed of particles**.

20 It follows that if **it** is **something that is particle-like or composed of particles**, then it's necessarily **impermanent**.

21 It follows that if **it** is **something that is particle-like or composed of particles**, then it's necessarily **selfless**.

22 It follows that if **it** is **a natural smell**, then it's necessarily **not an artificial smell**.

23 It follows that if **it** is **a natural smell**, then it's necessarily **a smell**.

24 It follows that if **it** is a citrusy smell, then it's necessarily a smell.

25 It follows that if **it** is a smell, then it's necessarily not form.

26 It follows that if **it** is a taste, then it's necessarily an object tasted in the domain of tongue consciousness.

27 It follows that if **it** is earth, then it's necessarily an element of tangibility.

28 It follows that if **it** is earth, then it's necessarily a tactile object.

29 It follows that if **it** is earth, then it's necessarily external matter.

30 It follows that if **it** is fire, then it's necessarily something that is particle-like or composed of particles.

WORKSHEET 11 - DRILL

2 Theses for 1 Pervasion (No Pervasion)

Instructions: First decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. Challenger will read out the statement of pervasion and Defender will say “Why?” Then the Challenger asks for an example. Defender provides an example, and then Challenger checks it. After exercise #15, switch roles.

e.g.

C: It follows that if **it** is **impermanent**, it is necessarily **matter**.

D: Why?

C: Posit an example.

D: Take the subject: **an ear consciousness perceiving thunder**.

C: Take the subject: **an ear consciousness perceiving thunder**. It follows that it's **impermanent**.

D: I accept.

C: Take the subject: **an ear consciousness perceiving thunder**. It follows that it's **not matter**.

D: I accept.

1 It follows that if **it** is **matter**, then it's necessarily **external matter**.

2 It follows that if **it** is **external matter**, then it's necessarily **an element**.

3 It follows that if **it** is **external matter**, then it's necessarily **shape**.

4 It follows that if **it** is **a shape**, then it's necessarily **a round shape**.

5 It follows that if **it** is **a circle**, then it's necessarily **a round shape**.

6 It follows that if **it** is **color**, then it's necessarily **the color of darkness**.

7 It follows that if **it** is **form**, then it's necessarily **the color of light**.

8 It follows that if **it** is **external matter**, then it's necessarily **sound**.

9 It follows that if **it** is **matter**, then it's necessarily **taste**.

10 It follows that if **it** is **particle-like or composed of particles**, then it's necessarily **smell**.

11 It follows that if **it** is **object**, then it's necessarily **impermanent object**.

12 It follows that if **it** is **selfless**, then it's necessarily **object**.

13 It follows that if **it** is **selfless**, then it's necessarily **impermanent object**.

14 It follows that if **it** is **something reasonably described as a hue**, then it's necessarily **the definition of color**.

15 It follows that if **it** is something reasonably identified as shape, then it's necessarily the definition of shape.

Now Switch Roles

16 It follows that if **it** is *not* intelligible sound, then it's necessarily *not* sound.

17 It follows that if **it** is *not* true speech, then it's necessarily *not* intelligible sound.

18 It follows that if **it** is *not* sound, then it's necessarily *not* external matter.

19 It follows that if **it** is *not* external matter, then it's necessarily *not* something that is particle-like or composed of particles.

20 It follows that if **it** is *not* something that is particle-like or composed of particles, then it's necessarily impermanent.

21 It follows that if **it** is *not* something that is particle-like or composed of particles, then it's necessarily selfless.

22 It follows that if **it** is a natural smell, then it's necessarily an artificial smell.

23 It follows that if **it** is *not a natural smell*, then it's necessarily *a smell*.

24 It follows that if **it** is *a citrusy smell*, then it's necessarily *a woody smell*.

25 It follows that if **it** is *a smell*, then it's necessarily *not matter*.

26 It follows that if **it** is *a taste*, then it's necessarily *a sweet taste*.

27 It follows that if **it** is *particle-like or composed of particles*, then it's necessarily *an element of tangibility*.

28 It follows that if **it** is *the earth element*, then it's necessarily *a visual form*.

29 It follows that if **it** is *the earth element*, then it's necessarily *external matter*.

30 It follows that if **it** is *hot and burning*, then it's necessarily *fire*.

WORKSHEET 12 - DRILL

Restate the Pervasion

Instructions: Decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. Challenger reads the 3-Part Syllogism, beginning with “Take the subject,” and then reads the written subject, predicate, and reason. The Defender responds by saying “No pervasion.” The Challenger then says “Restate the pervasion” and the Defender states the **negated** pervasion, (making sure to include the word **not** before the word **necessarily**). Add articles like “the, an, a” as you wish.

e.g.

C: Take the subject: **the sky**. It follows that it’s **permanent**, because it’s **matter**.

D: No pervasion!

C: Restate the pervasion.

D: If **it** is **matter**, it’s **not** necessarily **permanent**.

* Remember that some of the pervasions are valid while others are not, but here we’re just doing an exercise to train in the habit of learning how to restate the pervasion.

1	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: Not internal matter	because it is: matter
2	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: external matter	because it is: Not an elephant
3	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: Not external matter	because it is: matter
4	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: internal matter	because it is: particle-like or composed of particles
5	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: Not color	because it is: primary color
6	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: Secondary color	because it is: Not shape

SERA JEY DWS 2023

7	Subject: the color blue	It follows it is: colour	because it is: Not a secondary color
8	Subject: the color of clouds	It follows it is: matter	because it is: Not sound
9	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: Not secondary colour	because it is: Not shape
10	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: Not color	because it is: Not something reasonably identified as shape.
11.	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue.
12	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a color	because it is: Not something reasonably identified as a secondary hue.
13	Subject: shape	It follows it is: Not matter	because it is: particle-like or compose of particles
14.	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: A taste
15.	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: Not a color
16	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a sweet taste	because it is: external matter
17	Subject: matter	It follows it is: form	because it is: Not an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness.
18	Subject: something reasonably described as a secondary hue	It follows it is: not a color	because it is: a secondary color
19	Subject: something reasonably described as a hue	It follows it is: primary color	because it is: The color of mist
20	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: tangible object	because it is: matter

SERA JEY DWS 2023

21	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: particle-like or composed of particles
22	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: not a tangible object
23	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: Not brown	because it is: not blue
24	Subject: Color of a blue sky	It follows it is: Not blue	because it is: Not secondary color
25	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: not sound	because it is: Not short shape
26	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: not intelligible sound.
27	Subject: The smell of a lemon	It follows it is: not a woody smell	because it is: Not a chemical smell
28	Subject: the smell of a lemon	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a sour taste
29	Subject: A fragrant smell	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a shape
30	Subject: softness	It follows it is: not a tactile object	because it is: not element of tangibility

WORKSHEET 13 - DRILL

Reason not True or No Pervasion

Instructions: The following syllogisms are wrong. First decide who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. Challenger will read out the subject, predicate and reason and Defender will respond with “Reason not true” or “No pervasion.” Then change roles. You can start slowly but try to get faster as you practice.

e.g.

Take the subject:	It follow it is:	because it has:	Answer?
A flower	matter	energy	No pervasion

As the Defender, you can ask yourself the following questions to determine which answer to give...

First ask yourself: does a flower have energy?

(if **no** then “Reason not true”).

Then ask yourself: is everything that has energy necessarily matter?

(if **no** then “No pervasion”.)

Now respond to the following with “Reason not true” or “No pervasion.”

1	Subject: a flower	It follows has: life	because it has: energy
2	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: Has energy	because it is: an elephant
3	Subject: a flower	It follows it is: a perception	because it is: created by neurological activity
4	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: A hallucination	because it is: A controlled hallucination
5	Subject: the perception of the colour blue	It follows it is: A controlled hallucination	because it: arises from top-down predictive modeling inputs
6	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: secondary colour	because it is: shape
7	Subject: the color red	It follows it is: a shape	because it is: something reasonably identified as shape.
8	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a color

9	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: a taste.
10	Subject: the taste of chocolate	It follows it is: a bitter taste	because it is: external matter.
11	Subject: a form	It follows it is: a color	because it is: an object given over to experience through eye sensing modality and seen in the domain of visual consciousness.
12	Subject: a form	It follows it is: a color	because it is: something reasonably described as a hue.
13	Subject: something reasonably described as a hue	It follows it is: not a color	because it is: a secondary color.
14	Subject: something reasonably described as a hue	It follows it is: the color of mist	because it is: a color.
15	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: tangible object	because it is: matter.
16	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: a primary color.
17	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: a secondary color.
18	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: not blue.
19	Subject: color of dust	It follows it is: red	because it is: blue.
20	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: a sound.
21	Subject: the shape of an oak tree	It follows it is: unintelligible sound	because it is: not intelligible sound.
22	Subject: a lemon	It follows it is: a woody smell	because it is: not a chemical smell.
23	Subject: the smell of a lemon	It follows it is: not a citrusy smell	because it is: not a chemical smell.

Note that a reason can be flawed even when the thesis itself is true.

24	Subject: The taste of milk chocolate	It follows it is: sweet taste *	because it is: a bitter taste.
25	Subject: The taste of milk chocolate	It follows it is: sweet taste*	because it is: a taste.
26	Subject: The ear's modality	It follows it is: internal matter*	because it is: matter.
27	Subject: the eye's modality	It follows it is: internal matter*	because it is: not matter.
28	Subject: the nose's modality	It follows it is: internal matter*	because it is: a minty smell.
29	Subject: the tongue's modality	It follows it is: internal matter*	because it is: not exterior matter.
30	Subject: the body's modality	It follows it is: internal matter*	because it is: particle-like or composed of particles.

WORKSHEET 14 - DRILL

Extended Debates

Instructions: Choose who will be Challenger and who will be Defender. Try a debate starting with one of the following theses. When you get stuck check out the Extended Responses sheet to see if you can keep the debate going.

1. Subject: the empire State Building	It follows it is: a long shape
---	--

2. Subject: form	It follows it is: color
----------------------------	-----------------------------------

3. Subject: the color of red dust	It follows it is: a secondary color
---	---

4. Subject: the color of a rainbow	It follows it is: a color
--	-------------------------------------

5. Subject: a quark	It follows it is: matter
-------------------------------	------------------------------------

6. Subject: white	It follows it is: a primary color
-----------------------------	---

7. Subject: eye's modality	It follows it is: a visible object
--------------------------------------	--

8. Subject:	It follows it is:
--------------------	--------------------------

WORKSHEET 15 - DRILL

The Joints of Reasoning (Common Objects)

Instructions: The Challenger will give two objects by saying e.g. “It follows you can posit the difference between flower and form in terms of Three Joints, Four Joints, Equivalence, or Contradiction.” The Defender will accept and the Challenger will reply “Posit them.”

The Defender will identify the Joints of Reasoning between the two objects: *three joints, four joints, equivalence, contradiction.*

For now, you needn't give examples, just state how many Joints the two objects have. Try to work through this drill as quickly as possible!

1. dog	animal
2. dog	cat
3. bird	animal with feather
4. big animal	mammal
5. feline	pet
6. red apple	red thing
7. green apple	red thing
8. thing with color	car
9. permanent thing	impermanent thing
10. hot liquid thing	tea
11. grey thing	thing that are not black
12. fire	water
13. sentient being	thing with mind
14. fish	animal that swim
15. human	mammal
16. elephant	thing with trunk
17. Indian animals	elephant
18. building	elephant
19. orange juice	that which is squeezed from an orange.
20. female	nun
21. female	giraffe
22. physical objects	observable object

SERA JEY DWS 2023

23. female	person who wears a skirt
24. pot	earth
25. juice	not juice
26. things that have doors	vehicles
27. arachnid	eight legged creature
28. green	color of money
29. stars in the solar system	stars in the milky way
30. numbers	integers

Next pick out a few pairs that you like. The Challenger will ask the Defender how many Joints there are. The Challenger will then confirm the pervasions and ask the Defender for examples. (You can refer to the Counting the Joints Template to see how to do this.)

WORKSHEET 16 - Drill

The Joints of Debate (World of the Senses)

Instructions: The Challenger will give two objects by saying e.g. “It follows you can posit the difference between a flower and form in terms of Three Joints, Four Joints, Equivalence, and Contradiction.” The Defender will accept and the Challenger will reply “Posit them!”

The Defender will identify the joints of reasoning between the two objects: *equivalence, contradiction, three joints, four joints.*

The Challenger will then confirm the pervasions and ask the Defender for examples. (You can refer to the Joints of Debate Template to see how to do this)

The following are based on subjects from Lesson 2 of the Nalanda Debate textbook.

1. flower pot	something that is particle-like or composed of particles
2. subtle auditory sensing structure	the ear’s modality
3. the nose’s modality	the tongue’s modality
4. internal matter	the body’s modality
5. smell	object smelled in the domain of olfactory consciousness
6. tactile object	taste
7. shape	color
8. an object in the domain of an auditory consciousness which creates an understanding of semantic content.	intelligible sound
9. nutty smell	natural smell
10. the earth element	softness

Finally, pick out two subjects of your own choosing and try going over the joints, the pervasions and examples.

WORKSHEET 17 - DRILL

Tricky Joints

Instructions: The Challenger will give two objects by saying e.g. “It follows you can posit the difference between a flower and form in terms of Three Joints, Four Joints, Equivalence, and Contradiction.” The Defender will accept and the Challenger will reply “Posit them!”

The Defender will identify the joints of reasoning between the two objects: *equivalence, contradiction, three joints, four joints.*

The Challenger will then confirm the pervasions and ask the Defender for examples.

Here are some more interesting (and more difficult) subjects to compare. Don't be afraid to try out an answer to see if it works.

1. mind	consciousness
2. mind	brain
3. featherless bipeds	humans
4. humans	animals that use language
5. knowledge	things which have been learned
6. knowledge	information
7. caused things	impermanent objects
8. female	male
9. physical objects	observable objects
10. young people	old people
11. friend	foe
12. friend	relative
13. claim	information
14. particle	wave

SERA JEY DWS 2023

15. object of thought	phenomenon
16. mental consciousness	thought
17. planet inhabited by life	planet in the milky way
18. positive mental state	mental state with positive affect
19. prime numbers	even numbers
20. whole numbers	natural numbers

WORKSHEET 18 - EXERCISE

Translating Colloquial into Nalanda Debate

Instructions: Read through the following paragraphs and statements and try to ascertain the theses and pervasions that are being expressed by the colloquial statements. Then work with your partner to try and re-phrase them in the language of Nalanda Debate.

1. “Homeless people don’t deserve social services, because they’re just lazy – anyone can go out and get a job! Why should they be a drag on the rest of society just because they decided not to work?”
2. “I’m such a fool! I can’t believe I said that; now they’re all going to think I’m an idiot and never have true respect for me. I can’t show my face here again!”
3. “Look at how amazing the universe is! Its glory and beauty is not something that could have just randomly popped into existence. This is the proof that there must be a greater being behind it all, a perfect being who brought this wonderful creation into existence!”
4. “Look at how the different birds on the Galapagos Islands each have beaks shaped just perfectly for the seeds on the particular island on which they live. This means they must have adapted to their environment, changing over the course of generations to be

better suited to survive with the unique conditions of their environment.”

5. “I saw a Facebook group with all these people talking about the terrible diseases and deaths from people taking vaccines! I even saw a video where a young woman just collapsed out of nowhere! Can’t you see? Covid vaccines were just created to kill people.”

6. “That guy in the pickup cut me off! He’s an awful human being, just a total selfish jerk. I have every right to be angry at him and I’m not going to let this go. In fact, I hope he gets what’s coming to him.”

7. “Anger and greed are evolutionarily built into our human DNA. Across cultures and geographic zones, everywhere we look we see instances of violence, war, and acts of aggression. Anger is in fact a necessary quality because it alerts us to danger bad situations that could harm us. This is just part of human nature.”

8. “The celestial bodies all pass from one side of the sky to the other. The stars and moon exhibit regular patterns of movement that recur month by month and year by year. Therefore, this cosmos beyond our Earth must be orbiting the Earth, with the Earth at the center of it all.”

9. “When I think in a logical and unbiased way, it is obvious that all people, and even all living beings, enjoy happiness, care, and peace. None of them actually desires pain, misfortune, or harm. Compassion makes sense because it is a desire to see this

fundamental aim of living beings accomplished, without bias. Anger, however, is always associate with a narrow focus only on a specific limited group of individuals, or even just the needs of one person. Therefore, compassion is a valid mental state, while anger is a biased state.”

10. “Whenever anger is present, the mind is worked up – thoughts spiral and ruminate about some small thing, without considering the full scenario and the needs of all the players involved. As soon as clear-minded reflection is applied, the anger begins to weaken, and I’m able to consider a wider range of possibilities for why things unfolded the way they did and how to respond. Compassion, on the other hand, only grows stronger when this kind of reflection is applied. The more one’s scope broadens, the more stable the compassion becomes. Compassion is valid, and anger is invalid. Therefore, compassion can be infinitely increased, while anger cannot. Anger can be eliminated.”

Matter and the Physical World

Debate Outline

with definitions and categories for easy reference

Key:

Text in this font and color indicates important definitions and categories, which are to be used verbatim in your debates

Text in this font and color are explanations of the definitions, giving brief context for the approach used in making the categories of this outline.

Matter¹ – *something that is established as particle-like or composed of particles*

There are two types of matter when looked at from the perspective of their relationship to the affective quality of living organisms' minds:

- 1) matter foundational to the interior experiences of conscious organisms (Internal matter)
- 2) matter taken in as sensory content (External matter)

Material form – *something that can be pointed to or struck*²

Material form and **matter** are equivalent. **Physical forms, material objects, and physical bodies** are other equivalents of **matter**.

¹ Most textbooks list *form* as the main category here, and *matter* is emphasized less. An alternative definition of *form* is posited as "That which is suitable as form." The above definition indicates localization and tangibility as qualities of form. This textbook is emphasizing matter, because it is a more familiar term than *form*. To avoid confusing the broad category of *form* with the first division of external matter (also called *forms*, as in visual forms), we have opted to use the more descriptive term *material form* for the broad category.

² Readers will commonly see the definition of this definiendum cited as *that which is suitable as form*. The definition here is simply another feasible rendering of the Tibetan/Sanskrit, and highlights this important defining feature of physicality.

Internal matter – *a physical cause giving rise to sense impressions which is found within the continuum of a conscious organism.*

- 1) the eye's modality - subtle visual sensing structure
- 2) the ear's modality - subtle auditory sensing structure
- 3) the nose's modality - subtle olfactory sensing structure
- 4) the tongue's modality - subtle gustatory sensing structure
- 5) the body's modality - subtle tactile sensing structure

External matter – *a physical cause giving rise to sense impressions which is not found within the continuum of a conscious organism.*

- 1) Form – *an object seen in the domain of visual consciousness*
- 2) Sound – *an object heard in the domain of auditory consciousness*
- 3) Smell - *an object smelled in the domain of nose consciousness*
- 4) Taste - *an object tasted in the domain of taste consciousness*
- 5) Tactile object - *an object experienced in the domain of touch consciousness*

Eye consciousness and **visual consciousness** are equivalent; **ear consciousness** and **auditory consciousness** are equivalent; likewise with **nose consciousness** and **olfactory consciousness**; **tongue consciousness** and **gustatory/taste consciousness**; **body consciousness** and **tactile/touch consciousness**.

Body consciousness experiences tactile objects both within and outside of the body; thus it includes interoception.

Forms: When we categorize form along the lines of an ontology of what are experienced as basic visual objects, we observe two classes:

- 1) Shape – *something reasonably identified as shape*
- 2) Color – *something reasonable described as hue*

Shapes: further categorizing these along the lines of fundamental components of visual experience, we can compile a list of eight archetypal shapes:

- 1) long shape – *a shape characterized by lengthiness*
- 2) short shape – *a shape characterized by shortness of breadth*
- 3) high shape – *a shape characterized by tallness*
- 4) low shape – *a shape characterized by shortness of height*
- 5) round shape – *a shape of orb-like quality*
- 6) cubed shape – *a shape of box-like quality*
- 7) even shape – *a shape characterized by evenness or flatness*
- 8) uneven shape – *a shape characterized by jaggedness or unevenness*

Colors: these are categorized on the basis of whether the color is a mix of two other colors or not. Two different ways of understanding which colors are primary and which are secondary exist; in terms of additive color mixing and in terms of subtractive color mixing.

- 1) Primary color – *something reasonably described as a primary hue*
- 2) Secondary color – *something reasonably described as a secondary hue*

Primary colors: these require no mixing of other colors to make them, but differ depending on whether we're discussing colors of light or of pigments.

In additive color mixing (mixing light):

- 1) Red
- 2) Green
- 3) Blue

In subtractive color mixing (mixing pigments):

- 1) Blue
- 2) Yellow
- 3) White
- 4) Red

Secondary colors: are any colors created by mixing two or more other colors.

We can specify colors of certain natural phenomena in order to address misconceptions that can easily arise in relation to them. For instance, the colors of certain phenomena are visible from a distance but no longer visible as you move too close or shift your viewing angle, yet we still must acknowledge that they have color; thus, we can specify:

- 1) the color of clouds
- 2) the color of smoke
- 3) the color of dust
- 4) the color of mist

Likewise, the colors of some natural phenomena are only visible in relation to a solid object or an environment of objects, yet we must still acknowledge that they are not themselves the color of that solid object; thus, we can specify:

- 5) the color of light
- 6) the color of darkness
- 7) the color of sunrays
- 8) the color of shadows

Sounds: we can categorize sound according to various physical properties of the soundwaves, such as frequency and amplitude, which gives us the vocabulary of music and the dimensions of tone, pitch, harmony, resonance, etc. There are many different qualities of sound, but here the primary classification will be made in terms of the capacity of sounds to express semantic content – in other words, whether or not they have meaning.

- 1) **Intelligible sound** – *an object of hearing which creates an understanding of semantic content*
 - This is equivalent to speech sounds
 - Example – the word “Hello!”
- 2) **Unintelligible sound** – *an object of hearing which does not express a meaning*
 - This is equivalent to non-speech sounds
 - Example – the sound of a babbling brook

Smells: many types of molecules can be transduced by olfactory neurons and experienced as smell; there is no known way of determining or classifying smells based on molecular structure. Smells must simply be categorized according to common convention, and in this regard, there is a classification into ten:

- 1) Fruity
- 2) Citrusy
- 3) Fragrant
- 4) Minty
- 5) Sweet
- 6) Nutty
- 7) Woody
- 8) Chemical
- 9) Pungent
- 10) Decaying

Since the human nose is very apt at distinguishing naturally occurring odors from man-made scents, we can simplify the above classification into:

- 1) Natural smells
- 2) Artificial smells

Tastes: like smells, tastes are classified according to common convention; there also appears to be some physical basis in the arrangement of sensory neurons in the tongue, as well as in the molecular structures of taste molecules, for distinguishing different tastes.

- 1) Sweet
- 2) Sour
- 3) Bitter
- 4) Spicy
- 5) Salty
- 6) Astringent

Tactile objects: by observing the fundamental elements of our tactile experience – and likewise, the primary features of emergent physical objects that are empirically evident to our sense of touch – we can see how the traditional understanding of “the four elements” accounts for a robust classification of tactile objects. They constitute the primary constituents of tactile and interoceptive experience and form the basis for other, secondary tactile objects.

- 1) The elements of tangibility
- 2) Derivative tactile objects

The elements of tangibility: these four elements are elementary in the sense that they are primary objects as experienced internally and externally by way of bodily sensations. Additionally, they can be identified as primary components of all macroscopic physical objects in terms of the characteristics that they embody. They are not primary elements in the same way that carbon, oxygen, lithium, etc. are primary elements. However, they are akin to the basic states of matter: solids, liquids, gases. The element of warmth is akin to the phenomena of heat and combustion.

- 1) The earth element – *a thing that is hard and obstructive*
- 2) The water element – *a thing that is wet and fluid*
- 3) The fire element – *a thing that is hot and burning*
- 4) The air element – *a thing that is light and moving*

Alternatively, the following categories can be used, with the same definitions as given above:

- 1) Solids
- 2) Liquids
- 3) Heat
- 4) Gases

Derivative tactile objects: these include a variety of objects experienced as sensations in the domain of bodily consciousness – some of them are solely

experienced interoceptively while others are experienced both interoceptively and via the nerve receptors on the outer surface of the skin.

- 1) Softness
- 2) Roughness
- 3) Heaviness
- 4) Lightness
- 5) Hunger
- 6) Thirst
- 7) Cold

Notes on the Colors

A basic categorization of colors into primary and secondary lines up with most presentations of color theory. In contemporary art and science, we distinguish between additive color and subtractive color. A list based on subtractive color is made by looking at how *pigments* mix and create other colors rather than how *light* mixes to create colors. Subtractive color is what we have when we're talking about color pigments and not colors of light itself. When we perceive the blue color of a solid object (as opposed to seeing raw blue light emitted directly from a light source) it appears blue because the pigments in the object absorb all light wavelengths other than blue and reflect the blue wavelength back towards our eyes.

This is called "subtractive" because the color we perceive results from wavelengths of light being absorbed or subtracted out – thus if we mix enough color pigments together, we will end up with a perception of a black color. All of the wavelengths of light get absorbed, so none are reflected and we just perceive black. Simply due to surface reflectance, and other phenomena such as fluorescence, there is still some light reflected off a black object – an object that entirely absorbed all light would be like a black hole!

Additive colors, on the other hand, don't rely on some wavelengths of light being absorbed and others reflected. It's the wavelengths of light themselves that we see, so when they're mixed they produce white light. So then, we can conclude

that there is no such thing as black light. So how does the screen that you're looking at right now produce black, when the images on a screen are made from pure light being emitted?

Mindfulness Corner

The Nalanda Tradition gives the tools for a systematic inquiry into the nature of human experience, aka human consciousness. How does the current chapter – with its focus on the external world – lead to deeper understanding of your own experience?

As you reflect on and debate about these material objects, keep track of the interesting questions and doubts that arise. Then challenge yourself to more attentively and deeply observe your own experience of the five types of external matter. Cultivate mindfulness by clearly perceiving each one in turn; observe visual forms, sounds, smells, tastes, and tactile objects. Observe each of these in relation to one object, such as a tree or flower. Recognize in your experience the difference between the raw data of sensory consciousness and the thoughts, that you have about an object. Distinguish the conception of an object – how it appears in your thoughts – from the naked appearance that is present in your sense consciousnesses.